

INFLUENCE OF ISLAM ON THE POLITICAL DISCOURSE IN PAKISTAN DURING ZULFIQAR ALI BHUTO ERA (1970-1977)

Muhammad Iqbal*
Tariq Amin**

Abstract

Religion and politics in Pakistan are very closely related. This fusion of religion and politics took place before the creation of Pakistan as the very idea of a separate state for Indian Muslims was shaped by religion. After independence the issue got further impetus and the religious leaders, the ulema, very assertively demanded for Islamizing the system. The process actually started in 1949 with the passage of Objectives Resolution which provided for the Islamic foundation of future laws in Pakistan. The Objectives Resolutions was followed by three constitution passed by the regimes of different leaders ranging from Islamic oriented to the secular leaders like Ayub and Bhutto but none of them could dare separate religion from politics. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto contested and won election in 1970 on secular agenda but he could not implement his socialist program and soon had to retreat to Islam as a saving force. This paper is an account of Bhutto's Islamization process. The study attempts to discuss that how a secular leader with a socialist program resorted to Islam? What were those factors which barred Bhutto from implementing his agenda? The paper is a qualitative study largely based on secondary data gleaned from articles, books and theses.

Key words

Islamization, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto, law, Religion, Islam, politics.

Introduction

In 633 AD, during the reign of Hazart Umar, the second caliph of Islam, the Muslims interacted with India for the first time. Arab traders came to India and settled down near the coastal areas of Calcutta. However, as rulers, the Muslims for the first time appeared in 712 AD during Umayyad period when Muhammad bin Qasim attacked Raja Dahir, and conquered Debul. So, the Muslim rule in India started

* Lecturer at Pakistan Study Centre, University of Peshawar (corresponding and principle author)

** Lecturer at Pakistan Study Centre, University of Peshawar

in the early years of 8th century AD, and continued till mid-19th century. However, the incompetency and sluggishness of later Mughals provided space for the British East India Company and to fill the vacuum, the British started their political venture from Bengal in 1757 and by 1857 the Mughals had been completely supplanted. The unsuccessful war of Independence in 1857 formally ended the Mughal rule and brought India under the direct control of British Empire. However, soon the independence struggle was started against the British Empire which culminated in 1947 in the form of two independent states of India and Pakistan. During this freedom movement the Muslim leadership realized that without political power, they might lose their distinct religious and political identity. Both the major communities of India i.e. Hindus and Muslims were diametrically opposed to each other. Very often the success of one was the failure of the other (Hussain , 2016). So the Muslim decided to have a separate, independent state for themselves. During their struggle for Pakistan, Muslim League leadership overlooked linguistic, social and cultural differences of Indian Muslims and heavily relied on religion as a uniting factor. Two glaring facts which cannot be ignored during this discussion are one, that Muslim Leagues' leadership including founder Jinnah were liberal minded people and secondly, that almost all the religious people opposed the idea of a separate state for Muslim in the name of religion. Their argument goes that Islam does not ask its followers to divide and acquire land rather emphasizes on spreading its ideology. Consequently, as a result of political and constitutional struggle, the Muslims got an independent state in the shape of Pakistan.

From its very beginning the newly born state of Pakistan was confronted with a cluster of problems. Framing Constitution was one among those issues which needed immediate attention. Keeping in view, the political polarization in Pakistan at the time, constitution making was a daunting task, in such an environment, for a new state. The dilemma was that the political leadership was also not on the same page. They were broadly divided into two different groups, secular and Islamists. The former tried to make the state secular, despite the fact that in the pre-partition era they mobilized the Muslims for independent state in the name of religion. Secular forces argued that Jinnah did not want an Islamic state. They would refer to Jinnah's 11th August speech in which he said:

“In course of time all these angularities of the majority and the minority community will vanish... You are free, you are free to go to your temples, you are free to go to your mosques or to any other places of

worship in the State of Pakistan. You may belong to any religion or caste or creed—that has nothing to do with the business of the State... We should keep that in front of us as our ideal and you will find that in course of time Hindus would cease to be Hindus and Muslims would cease to be Muslims, not in the religious sense, because that is personal faith of each individual, but in the political sense as citizens of the State.”

After getting a separate state, most of the Pakistani populous out-rightly rejected the idea of a secular state and strongly demanded for an Islamic system. The religious leaders who opposed Pakistan, changed their mind soon after the creation of Pakistan, and called for Islamization of the country. A struggle between Islamists and liberals started for making a constitution as per their whims and wishes. Eventually, both the schools of thought reached to a compromise in 1949 with the passage of Objectives Resolution. The resolution provided guiding principles for constitution which says, that sovereignty belongs to God Almighty over the entire universe. It also declared Islam as the *raison d’être* of Pakistan. The main points of the Objectives Resolution are democratic tenets, social justice, freedom, equality and tolerance as articulated by Islam. Hereafter, religion became integral in the process of nation building in Pakistan. With adopting this document at least it was decided that the state will not be a secular one. Therefore, it can be called a triumph of ulema to some extent if not fully.

The passage of Objectives Resolution was followed by a period stalemate. There was a deadlock on different constitutional proposals, however, in 1956 the first ever constitution was passed by the second constituent assembly. The constitution consisted of some Islamic provisions. The Objectives Resolution was made the preamble which was not the substantive part of the constitution. Other provisions included, Islamization of existing laws, enabling the Muslim citizens of Pakistan to order their lives, individually and collectively, according to the teachings of Islam. The Head of the State should be a Muslim citizen and not less than 40 years of age.

Objective Resolution further says that State will be responsible for prohibiting prostitution, gambling, and consumption of alcohol. In addition to that the early elimination of *riba* was also promised. Moreover, the president will establish an Islamic Research Institute which will assist the process of restructuring of Muslim society on true Islamic lines. No legislation will be allowed in contrast to the teachings

of Islam. All the current laws will be made in accordance with the teaching of Islam.

The Breakdown of Constitutional Machinery

The constitution of 1956 hardly worked for two and half years. On October 7, 1958 martial law was declared and the constitution was trashed. Ayub Khan became the Chief Martial Law Administrator who ruled the country for the next decade. He had little tendency towards Islamic symbolism. The constitution of 1962, initially, even removed the word, "Islamic" from the official name of the country. However, he had to restore it after facing stiff resistance from Islamists. Ayub era came to an end in 1969.

He was followed, though for a short period, by Yahya Khan, another military dictator. Like his predecessor both in army and in government, he too had no romance for Islamization nor for Islamic political parties. His era is remembered for the first ever, free and fair general election in 1970. Another remarkable event during Yahya was the separation of erstwhile East Pakistan in 1971. Subsequently, he had to resign and thus paved the way for ZA Bhutto to start his innings as head of the state after Yahya's ouster and as head of the government after enforcement of 1973 constitution.

Islamization of Laws during ZA Bhutto's Era

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto, the son of a Sidhi landlord Sir Shahnwaz Bhutto was introduced to power corridor by Iskander Mirza, whom Bhutto kept in high esteem. Bhutto continued in the Ayub's cabinet as minister of Commerce and soon he was appointed foreign minister who remained on the same position till 1967 when he resigned.

Bhutto's relations with Ayub soon ran into trouble over the Tashkent Agreement with India. He resigned from cabinet and from Muslim League as well. In 1967, Bhutto founded his own political party the Pakistan People's Party. The manifesto of the party is started with the motto, 'Islam is our Faith, Democracy is our Polity and Socialism is our Economy, All power to people.' The ultimate objective of the party was the attainment of classless society in Pakistan which was possible only through socialism. PPP claims that its socialism is not contrary to Islam rather it aims follow from the political and social ethics of Islam. The party struggles to put to practically implement the noble ideals of Islam (Wolpert 1994, 79, 149).

Bhutto was very hard on criticism. He would counter any criticism in more strongest terms than that of criticism. He dubbed the

prevailing system as not Islamic. He criticized the capitalism and called it 'highway robbery' which even does not exist in America. He questioned that how a system, in which the living condition of people is deteriorating, can be Islamic. He argued that this vicious system can only be done away with via socialism and that was the reason that PPP stands for socialism (Wolpert 1994, 150).

Speaking to an election rally, Bhutto referred to Islam, he said, *"Islam is our religion. We are Muslims and we are proud of that. You know that I have served not only Pakistan but I have also served Islam in the Middle East. Allah will decide on Judgment Day how best I have served the cause of Islam."* (quoted in Wolpert, 174).

He further said that after Islam our second principle is democracy because it is provided in Islam. Once speaking in Quetta, Bhutto said that Liaqat Ali Khan, the first prime minister was murdered for he wanted Islamic socialism (Wolpert 1994, 182).

Bhutto's Pakistan People's Party stood victorious, in West Pakistan, in the aforementioned elections. (Ahmad, 2010). When Bhutto took over the power that was the gravest time in the short history of Pakistan. The very survival of the country was at stake. Validity of Two Nation Theory was questioned. Making Pakistan a great country out of pieces was his determination. Constitution was one of the serious challenges which Bhutto had to face. He successfully gave the nation a new and unanimous constitution which was implemented on August 14, 1973, on the 26th birthday of Pakistan. Under the new setup ZA Bhutto assumed power as prime minister of the remaining Pakistan (former West Pakistan) (exahmadi.blogspot.com, 2015)

Bhutto, albeit having secular and leftist outlook, had to change his philosophy of socialism and secularism just to get the favour of the ulema. Bhutto's PPP never asked the masses' support on religious grounds nor he had ever portrayed himself as a devoted Muslim. They only talked of the Islamic principle of social justice. But soon he had to change his secular socialist identity and resorted to religion. The debacle of East Pakistan had changed the political scenario of Pakistan. Religion was now a powerful phenomenon in the political discourse of the country. Bhutto realized that Islam will shape the future politics of Pakistan. So, he had to yield to Islamism. In this regard, to change the perception of being secular and socialist, Bhutto introduced the concept 'Islamic Socialism' and Musawat-i-Muhammadi (Ahmad, 2010). Bhutto wanted Islamic socialism that it would wither away all the disparities in Pakistan (Wolpert 1994, 175). Islamic fundamentalists

become more powerful inside Bhutto's government and his party as well. Many of his old comrades including, Mubashir Hasan, JA. Rahim and Khurshid Hasan Meer the most important and closest to Bhutto, were removed from cabinet (Wolpert 1994, 306). But for ulema this change of strategy had no attraction. Maulana Maudoodi saw no difference in socialism which was in China and Islamic Socialism which was the brain child of Bhutto. Jama'at-e-Islami attacked Bhutto and his party as 'anti-Islamic' (Wolpert 1994, 209). Maulana Shah Ahmad Noorani of JUP also held the same opinion. Like his predecessors, Bhutto asserted that service to Islam was his main objective. Another factor of Bhutto's shift from secular and socialist stance towards Islamism was to get closer to the oil rich Saudi Arabia and United Arab Emirates, who were sponsoring every type of Islamic activities in Pakistan to save it from drifting towards socialism (Ahmad, 2010). To get closer to Arabs and please the religious leaders inside Pakistan, Bhutto took a further step forward declared Friday as weekly holiday on July 1, 1977 just four days before his ouster and subsequent assassination.

According to Lawrence Ziring, an expert of Pakistani politics.

"Bhutto's quasi-socialist predispositions appeared contrary to the purposes of the Islamic Republic. His repeated reference to Islamic socialism, however, did influence the course of the Pakistan nation. Bhutto proved to be the transition between the Islamic Republic and the Islamic State" (Ziring, 1984).

Bhutto meet Maulana Mawdoodi and both agreed to that Pakistan should be an 'Islamic Republic' and its president and prime minister both will be Muslims, and that no law in repugnancy with Islam will be enacted, Islam will be the 'State Religion'. He also assured Mawdoodi that his slogan of Islamic socialism has no commonality or similarity with communism and it would not violate any law of Islam. During constitution making process Bhutto was especially more conciliatory towards religious political parties ie Jama'at-e-Islami, Jamiat-ul-Ulam-e-Islam and Jama'at-e-Islami, Jamiat-ul-Ulam-e-Pakistan by promising to them that president and prime minister will Muslims. They will also be bound to take oath that special steps would be taken for the study of Arabi as language and that error free printing of Quran would be assured. He also promised that the Islamic Ideology Council would be further strengthened (Wolpert 1994, 265, 273).

The problem which Bhutto tackled on priority and emergency basis was constitution making. After the adoption of interim

constitution in 1972, a committee was constituted, consisting of the following MNAs.

Mehmood Ali Kasuri (Chairman) Dr Mubashir Hasan, Malik Ghulam Mustafa Khar, Malik Meraj Khalid, Mumtaz Ali Bhutto, Ghous Bux Bizenjo, Ghulam Mustafa Khan Jatoi, Abdul Hafeez Pirzada, Syed Qaim Ali Shah, Dr Mrs Ashraf Abbasi, Dr Ghulam Hussain, Malik Muhammad Akhtar, Maulana Kausar Niazi, Khurshid Hassan Meer, Sheikh Muhammad Rashid, Maulana Mufti Mehmud, Khan Abdul Qayyum Khan, Muhammad Haneef Khan, Maulana Shah Ahmad Noorani, Professor Ghafoor Ahmad, Amirzada Khan, Sardar Shaukat Hyat Khan, Mian Mumtaz Muhammad Khan Daultana, Niamatullah Khan Shinwari and Begum Nasim Jehan.

The committee was supposed to propose recommendations for future constitution before August 1, 1972. The committee submitted its report to National Assembly by December 31, 1972. Apart from the committee, the political parties on its own also gave different proposals to the government. Jama'at-e-Islami, a rather proactive among religious political parties, gave the following proposal:

- That Quran and *sunnah* will be fundamental sources of law, and all other laws which are in contradiction to Quranic teachings should be nullified.
- Using of intoxicants, gambling, prostitution and *riba* etc should be banned.
- The fundamental human rights should be provided inclusive guarantee. Provision of basic human needs like food, cloths and shelter will be the responsibility of the state (Shah n,d).

Assembly passed the constitution almost unanimously on April 10, 1973. Two days later Speaker of the Assembly Fazal Elahi Chudry formally presented the constitution to President Bhutto for presidential assent. Thus the new constitution was of Islamic Republic of Pakistan was finalized, "in the name of Allah, the Beneficent and Merciful." The preamble begins with the declaration that sovereignty over the entire universe belongs to Allah alone and the authority to be exercised by the people of Pakistan within the limits prescribed by Him as a sacred trust" (Wolpert 1994, 273).

In this constitution Bhutto drastically departed from his secular approach and made a compromise with the religious leaders. Bhutto successfully made a unanimous constitution and enacted it on August 14, 1973. In this way, Bhutto also wanted to change the general perception of the people that he is purely a secular and socialist leader. The Islamic provisions of the two previous constitutions i.e. 1956 and 1962, were included with some new additions, such as Islam as the

official religion of the state and prime minister must be a Muslim citizen. For the first time in this constitution 'Muslim' was defined, through a constitutional amendment in 1974, as a person who has firm belief in the absolute oneness of God Almighty, and the absolute finality of the Holy Prophet Muhammad (PBUH). (Constitution of Pakistan, 1973 Article 260(3)(A))

With the insertion of this definition, the Ahmadies were dubbed as non-Muslim community by a constitutional amendment. The oaths for the president, prime minister and Muslim members of parliament were also changed. Beliefs in the oneness of God, unquestionable finality of the Prophet Muhammad (PBUH), Quran as the last revealed book of Allah and belief in the Day of Judgment, were included in oaths of their respective offices. Government servants were also required to stay committed to the preservation of the Islamic Ideology (Shah, n.d).

The constitution guaranteed fundamental rights but subjected to conformity with Islam and solidarity of the state. It further ensured that steps to be taken for enabling the Muslims of Pakistan to order their individual and collective lives in line with the teachings of Islam. Constitution provided, that Muslims will be enabled to understand the purpose of life in the light of Islamic injunctions. The teaching of Islamic Studies as a subject was made compulsory in schools. For the easy understanding of Quran and sunnah, the government had to take steps to promote the learning of Arabic language. Government was made responsible for publication of error free Quran. Under the new constitution, it was stated that riba will be eliminated in all its forms. State was made responsible for the organization of Zakat and Auqaf. It was stated that special relations with Islamic states of the world will be preserved in order to get Muslims united. In the Constitution of 1973, there are Islamic provisions in articles 227-231. These articles say that all prevailing laws will be made in accordance with the teachings of Islam and no law will be enacted which is against Islam (Constitution of Pakistan 197 Articles 227 to 231 (3)). The opponents, however, hailed the constitution was neither Islamic, nor Federal or democratic. On the other hand Bhutto proudly and loudly called the constitution as Islamic, Federal and Democratic (Wolpert 1994, 274).

Zufiqar Ali Bhutto created ministry for religious affairs for the first time in Pakistan. Ulema, however, did not welcome the new ministry and opined that the entire state machinery should regulate their affairs according to Islam instead of establishing any such ministry. In order to please Arabs and some section here in Pakistan, Bhutto for the first time introduced Arabic courses at school level. Islamic study was

also retained to be the compulsory subject. Imam of Ka'aba was invited to visit Pakistan and on his arrival a warm welcome was extended to him. Besides, Bhutto ordered that a copy of Quran should be placed in all rooms of all first-class hotels in the country. Provincial Awqaf departments were instructed to hire imams for mosques. Those imams drawing salary from the government, so that they would not speak against government (Shah, n.d).

In 1976, Bhutto sponsored an international seminar on the life and work of Prophet Muhammad (PBUH). When felt threatened by the PNA movement in 1977, Bhutto took some Islamic measures which included, the prohibition of alcohol, ban on gambling in all its forms and shutting down of all night clubs. He further announced that the Islamization of civil and criminal laws would be completed in six months instead of four years. Moreover, in order to include leaders of religio-political parties to implement Shari'ah laws, the Council of Islamic Ideology was reconstituted.

In order to bring down PNA strike and consolidate his position Bhutto informed ambassador of Saudi about a conspiracy against the country. Bhutto argued that some elements inside PNA wants to bring Asghar Khan into power and then eliminate him and replace him with Wali Khan and dismember country. He informed ambassador about funds being given by Soviet Union for this plan. He further argued that subversion of Pakistan would mean and end to Islam in South Asia (Wolpert 1994, 366-7).

Bhutto's firm conviction was that Islam for a Muslim State Islam could be the unifying force. Applying this principle to Indian subcontinent, Bhutto firmly believed that Pakistan was historically inevitable. According to Bhutto, Pakistan which came into existence in 1947 was not the one which was envisioned by its creators (Mody 1973, 50).

Council of Islamic Ideology (CII)

As an Islamic state, it was inserted in all the constitutional drafts and the previous two constitutions that no law will be made against the teachings of Islam. And that all the existing laws will be brought in conformity with Quran and Sunnah. For this purpose, General Ayub constituted an Advisory Council of Islamic Ideology to give proposals to the provincial and central government as how to enable its citizen to order their collective and individual lives according to Islam along with examination of all existing laws to make them according to Islam. Bhutto not only retained the council but also changed its name and composition to please the Ulema. Articles 228 to

231 of the Constitution deal with the composition, functions and rules of procedure of the Council.

Functions of the Council

There are four main functions of the Council mentioned in the article 230 (1) of the Constitution of Pakistan. Those functions are:

- a. To make recommendations to the Parliament and provincial assemblies the ways and means as to enable the citizens of Pakistan to order their lives, in all respects, according to the injunctions of Islam.
- b. To advise the central and provincial legislatures and President or Governors on any question referred to it whether a law is in conformity with Islamic injunctions.
- c. To recommend measures to bring the current laws in consonance with the teachings of Islam and to propose steps to bring it into practice. If the council declares any law repugnant to Islam, referred by any of the above-mentioned authorities, that law should be reconsidered.
- d. To compile in a suitable way, for the guidance to the legislatures such injunctions of Islam which can be given legal effect (Constitution of Pakistan, 1973, Article 230 (1).

Article 230(4) bounds the Council to submit its final report within seven years after the commencement of the Constitution, i.e. by 1980. The Council has to examine the laws from time to time and submit its annual interim reports. It was made mandatory that Parliament or provincial assemblies will make laws within two years after receiving the interim or final report (Constitution of Pakistan, 1973, art 230 (4)).

Declaring Qadianis Non-Muslims Minority

Another most important step towards Islamization was taken by Bhutto by declaring Qadianis as non-Muslim minority. The demand for declaring Ahmadis as non-Muslim minority appeared in early 1950s. For this purpose, a movement was launched by the ulema in early 1953. The demand was made on the basis that since Ahmadiyyas or Qadinis do not believe in the finality of the Holy Prophet Muhammad as the last Prophet of Allah, therefore, they should be declared a non-Muslim. Although, Ahmadis or Qadinies flatly denied this and claimed that Mirza Ghulam Ahmad Qadiani was only a reformer and mujtahid not a prophet (Ballard, 2015).

Furthermore, Ulema demanded the removal of sir Zafarullah Khan from his office as foreign minister as he was an Ahmadi. The

Prime Minister, Khwaja Nazimuddin refused to yield to the demand of the ulema. Consequently, an intense movement in Punjab against Ahmadis and Tahreek Khatmunnabwah was launched by the Ulema. The movement got violent and led to many casualties. The situation reached to such a point that the government had to impose martial law in Punjab. Justice Munir Commission, which was formed to investigate the reasons of violence, blamed Majlas-i-Ahrar and Jama'at-i-Islami for provoking public against Ahmadis (Ballard, 2015).

The movement was silenced for quite a long time. However, on the eve of OIC summit in Lahore in 1974, once again the movement started to classify Ahmadis as non-Muslims. In May 1974, charged students of Nishtar Medical College, majority of whom were members of Islami Jamiat Talba, student wing of Jama'at-i-Islami, clashed with Ahmadis. Students were beaten up by hockey sticks and severely injured. JI started protest with the support of PML, Tahreek-e-Istiqlal and Majlas-e-Ahrars, and demanded that those involved in the incident should be brought to justice or otherwise they would launch protest rallies across the country. Though in the beginning Bhutto did not allow any discussion in the National Assembly on the issue but in June 1974, under the public pressure, the government agreed to take the matter to National Assembly for discussion. It is pertinent to know that in the election of 1974 Ahmadis completely supported PPP. Many of the PPP stalwarts would visit Rabwah and assured them that no one could harm them in the National Assembly.

Mufti Mehmood of JUI and Mian Tufail of JI demanded that a bill from the National Assembly should be passed to declare Ahmadis as non-Muslims. Bhutto's government tried to resist the demand of opposition but finally yielded and appointed Maulana Kausar Niazi, to hold meetings with the ulema. They agreed to constitute a parliamentary committee to look into the matter. There were extensive discussions in the committee. After thorough discussions, proper time was given to leaders of Ahmadi community and their take on the issue was also considered. On September 7, 1974, in the light of the recommendations of parliamentary committee, Bhutto's government passed second amendment and Ahmadis were declared non-Muslims (Paracha, 2013). Thus the long-standing demand of the ulema was met by a secular leader, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto.

Socialism vs Islamic socialism

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto's journey towards socialism started in his last years in Berkeley. Jawaharlal Nehru was his hero and political role modal in many respects (Wolpert, 1979, 48). When Bhutto formed

Pakistan People Party, he made 'Socialism is our economy' was one of the slogans of PPP (Hasan, 30). Bhutto however was not the first leader in Pakistan to use the term. Before him, according to Conn (1976) at least three theories, since 1920s, about Islamic Socialism had been presented in subcontinent. The first one came from Maulana Ubaidullah Sindhi, second one from Hafiz al-Rahman Sihwarwi and the third one emerged after the creation of Pakistan in the works of Khalifa Abdul Hakim. All the three found Islamic economic modal as identical with that of socialism or communism (Conn, 1976).

In 1948 a comparison between Islam and communism was made by communist Party of Pakistan. As there are many commonalities between the two major ideologies i.e. both struggle for bringing a revolution in the society and change of civilization. Both ideologies believe that man is essentially good by nature, it is the society which controls his actions or makes him good or bad. Both aim to achieve classless society and equal distribution of wealth. Probably in this backdrop one of the Muslim League member of parliament stated, "Islamic socialism is as much above communism and if communism comes into contact with Islamic socialism, I am sure we may be able to convert it into the Islamic cult" (Chengappa, 2002).

According to the manifesto of PPP, socialism is 'true equality of the citizens, fraternity under the rule of democracy in an order based on economic and social justice'. In order to achieve its aims, the party would introduce peaceful and quick changes in the economic system, which would lead to a more just socio-economic program by allowing progressive change in the way of the final objectives (Mody 1973, 79).

Bhutto used Islamic Socialism for politically mobilizing people against Ayub Khan. During and before Ayub regime there was unjust distribution of goods. PPP was the first party to acknowledge the principle of distributive justice. The slogan of Islamic socialism was designed in such a way that suited the prevailing conditions i.e. unequal distribution of wealth. The slogan of Islamic socialism made PPP a mass based political party. Bhutto used this slogan as channel for his views and thus was able to get mass support. The slogan successfully attracted the lower and middle class in both urban and rural areas of Pakistan (Chengappa, 2002).

Taseer (1979) says that it was a gradual shift towards the idea of socialism. As much as Bhutto was sensing public response he would become more strident. The more he would become socialist, the more his message would become agitational, by the time of campaign for election in 1970, his style undergone a radical change (Taseer 1979, 83).

The idea of 'Islamic Socialism' was originally conceived by JA Rahim, Mubashir Hasan and Bhutto. The prefix of 'Islamic' was added to preempt any criticism by opponents. The implementation of Islamic socialism was aimed at bringing land reforms, labour reforms, nationalization of major industries, banks, educational and health sectors (Chengappa, 2002).

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto was a staunch believer of socialism. The very manifesto of PPP declares that socialism is our economy. He, once speaking to Muzaffargarh bar council, said that Islam made the basis of Pakistan and any party that does not make Islam as its ideology is not a Pakistani party. He further added that Islam and socialism are compatible with each other. According to him the ongoing loot and plunder in Pakistan can only be checked through socialism. The ultimate objective of PPP, according to its manifesto of 1970, is the establishment of classes society which was possible only through socialism. According to ZA Bhutto the current anomalies can only be tackled through socialism. Bhutto told the people that he has burnt his boats for democracy and socialism. (Wolpert, 1993; 148, 150, 158). In a bid to prove Islam and Socialism compatible, Bhutto while speaking to a public gathering in Karachi during election campaign he said, "if there was any conflict between Islam and socialism, I swear we would have rejected socialism. I'm a Muslim first and need no certificate." (Taseer, 106, 108; 1979)

On one occasion he said, that our problems cannot be solved until we introduce Islamic Socialism which, he said, is the basis of Ideology of Pakistan. He further argued that the very ideals for which the Muslims of India sacrificed their lives are ignored. Bhutto said that the state can make progress only when the life standard of peasants and workers is improved and equality among people is established according to Islamic way of life (Junejo, 1996, 64). On another occasion Bhutto said, "Pakistan can progress only if its economy is based on the principles of socialism. I advise the people to draw guidance from the Quran itself and not to be misled by the clever and twisted observations of selfish and hired maulvis" (Junejo 1996, 74).

On another occasion he said, that the fundamental guidance for solution to all problems would be taken from the teachings of Quai-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah and that his party would apply itself to the nation's problems with unshakable faith in God Almighty and with pride in the religion of Islam. Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto wanted to bring radicle changes in Pakistan. He was determined to create classless society, which according to Bhutto was possible only through Socialism (Mody,1973; 70, 79).

Bhutto was criticized for being a rich feudal lord of Sindh speaking of socialism. He replied to such criticism by saying that he is not so fool to hand over his wealth to capitalist government and allow them to make more money out of his properties. He asked the government to introduce socialism and then take all his wealth and properties. He called himself an honest socialist and will fight for socialism till the last breath of his life. He further argued that he has left his class and has joined the poor class of peasants, labourers and poor students because he was a socialist and loves these people. He said that socialism is a reality and no power can stop it from happening and coming to Pakistan. Bhutto compared himself with those rich Ahli-Quraish who abandoned all the wealth and status and stood behind the prophet Hazrat Muhammad SAW (Wolpert 1994, 159).

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto saw a remedy for all the disparities in socialism. He assured the Pakistani nation that once socialism is implemented all their worries will be over. He said that he can go to any end for socialism, "I can sacrifice anything for socialism, even my children" said Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto while speaking to a public gathering.

PPP wanted socialism because all the major industries are owned by private owners which make undue profits and is a source of excessive exploitation, insufficient production and wastage of resources. Maulana Kausar Niazi was against the slogan, 'socialism is our economy' (Hasan 2000, 30, 203).

There was a big question whether Islamic Socialism was compatible with Islam or not. To address this issue, Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto included two Molvies, Maulana Muhammad Saeed and Maulana Qudratullah in the party just to 'ensure Islamic credentials of his party'. They were included to tell the people that there was no clash between Islam and socialism. In 1969 Bhutto was declared kafir for propagation of socialism. (Chengappa, 2002, Taseer, 87; 1979). In a speech in Peshawar in 1972 he told the people that Socialism does not pose any threat to Islam.

Bhutto sought support for his 'Islamic Socialism' in the poetry of Allama Iqbal and in the quotations of Quaid-e-Azam. In the convention of PPP in 1972, he stated that we want to establish Islamic socialism, the socialism of Quaid-e-Azam (Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto Speeches and statements October 1, 1972 – December 31, 1972; 106, 159). He said 'Islam is our faith which is the base of Pakistan. Pakistan cannot stay without the supremacy of Islam. A socialist government does not contradict with Islamic supremacy rather it will make all the people of Pakistan the custodians of Islam. According to Bhutto, Islamic Socialism has been successful in many Islamic countries and it

will also make progress of Pakistan sure. In ordered to further attract people towards his slogan, he referred to Musawat-e-Muhammadi (egalitarianism of Muhammad SAW) instead of Islamic Socialism. Further he termed socialism as the 'highest expression' of democracy (Chengappa, 2002).

Bhutto in his speech to the students in Lahore in 1972, said that PPP has firm belief in Islamic Socialism. He further said that Islamic Socialism was the only remedy for our multifold problems, and only socialism can ensure economic prosperity and social uplift in Pakistan (Zulfikar Ali Bhutto Speeches and statements October 1, 1972 – December 31, 1972, 25).

Chengappa (2002) discussed the phenomenon of Islamic Socialism in two phases. The first phase was from 1972 to 1974 when massive nationalization took place. The second phase 1974 to 1977, PPP changed its policy and drifted away from Islamic Socialism. PPP gave many concessions religio-political parties in many ways. The most important among those concessions was the declaration of Ahmadya as non-Muslim minority. The price hike of oil in 1973, which empowered Saudi Arabia and other Arab stats economically and politically, was one of the major reasons for this ideological change by Bhutto.

Taseer (1979) says, though Bhutto declared his adherence to 'socialism' in loud and clear terms, still the political dogma of Bhutto was not clear. His brand of socialism, however, was not Marxist or atheistic. It was more inclined towards egalitarianism. Through this way he proved himself a friend of weak against the strong. Moreover, he played with different prejudices including against Hinduism. Taseer further argues that 'Islamic' was added as prefix to 'Socialism' to make it acceptable for the conservative countrymen. At different times Bhutto eulogized Scandinavian type of 'socialisms' welfare socialism and free economy. In one of his speeches in National Assembly in 1962, Bhutto advocated free enterprises as prerequisite for democracy. Taseer further says, that Bhutto was a pragmatic leader and he was not stanchly adhered to a specific political dogma (Taseer 1979, 199-200).

Bhutto, however, was of the opinion that our economy was based on the concept of Islamic socialism which is different from communism. He called his socialism on which Pakistani economy was base, the scientific socialism, not communism (Zulfikar Ali Bhutto Speeches and statements October 1, 1972 – December 31, 1972, 29, 159, 182, 244).

In an Interview with CBS Television Team On, November 1, 1972, the correspondent asked about his modal of socialism that

whether there is total nationalization, Bhutto replied, that not all but only heavy industries are being nationalized. He further stated that we will gradually move towards complete socialism in different phases (Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto Speeches and statements October 1, 1972 – December 31, 1972, 76). In a speech in Peshawar Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto mixed anti Indian sentiments, socialism and nationalism in his concept of Islamic socialism.

Impacts of Islamic Socialism

During the course of Islamic socialism, economy was restructured, major industries were taken in government control. The nationalization of financial institution broke the nexus of financial and industrial elite. Due to nationalization of large scale industries, the local level small scale industries were developed. The control of education and health sectors proved counterproductive. Owing to nationalization of schools overall literacy rate and higher education enrolment was reduced.

Owing to its ideology of 'Islamic Socialism' PPP became very popular among the masses and successfully mobilized the people for political gains. Bhutto used this channel to communicate with the people through this catchy slogan of Islamic Socialism which revolved around the slogan 'roti, kapra, makan (bread, cloth and shelter). One major political impact of Bhutto's ideology was the emergence of Nizam-e-Mustafa (Muhammad's (SAW) social system) which was initiated in response to Islamic Socialism. Religious elite, especially Jama'at Islami leader Maulana Maudoodi, strongly opposed the ideology of Bhutto and dubbed it anti Islam and ideology of Pakistan. Nizam-e-Mustafa was taken by Zia, the successor of Bhutto, and attempted to implement in Pakistan.

Bhutto inherited Pakistan after the partition of Bengal in 1971 with an extremely fragile and poor economy. Bhutto was severely criticized for his economic policies which were similar to state of capitalism. Bhutto's was forced for it because the investors were reluctant to invest in Pakistan. Massive mismanagement was witnessed in public sector enterprises during Bhutto's government.

Agriculture, the most important sector of economy, saw a boom in Bhutto period. Credit, price policy and subsidies helped agriculture sector grow. Provision of tractors on subsidized rates, shift of banking system from class banking to mass banking also proved of great help for agriculture development. On the other hand, the nationalization of agro industries proved politically and economically a

disaster for government. It was a myopic step which not only antagonized PPP's own constituencies but also eroded its credibility.

Islamic Socialism was actually the manifestation of secularism rather than an Islamic concept. The ideology of Islamic Socialism, in the words of Chengappa (2002) was successful in achieving its objectives and strengthened political economy which was inherited by Zia's government which enabled the alter to rule for a decade long period. The first phase of Islamic Socialism from 1972 to 1974 irrevocably affected Pakistan both negatively and positively. The use of Islamic Socialism reduced political Islam to the background for at least three years. Bhutto for the first time the changed the political discourse by using idea of Islamic Socialism. Economics become dominant discourse than politics, masses were mobilized greatly than it was done previously (Chengappa, 2002).

Conclusion

From the very inception of Pakistan in 1947, Islam has been a decisive factor in political discourse of Pakistan. It has been the only uniting factor in a heterogeneous society like Pakistan which is divided along the cultural, linguistic and social lines. Islam has also been used as a legitimizing factor by different leaders, including both civilian and military. Whenever they felt any threat to their rule, they retreated towards religion.

Zulfiqar Ali Bhutto is no exception. Mindful of the importance of religious factor in Pakistani politics, he tried to wrap his secular socialist identity in the garment of religion. He never portrayed himself as a religious leader. It is also a fact that he contested election on secular agenda but still had to restore to religion to strengthen his position. Pakistan People's Party government is responsible for adopting Islamization as a state policy. Bhutto very skillfully used eliciting religious slogans like Musawati Muhammadi, (the egalitarianism of Muhammad) and Islami Musawat, (Islamic equality) to secure the support of the public for electoral victory. He can be called, paradoxically, the real harbinger of Islamization in Pakistan.

Bhutto, through the process of Islamisation galvanized public opinion in his favor along with the neutralizing of Islamist political parties at home, similarly, on the international front, it helped him cultivating cordial relations with oil-rich middle eastern countries. Despite, his slogans and steps for Islamisation such as Musawati Muhammadi, Islami Musawat, declaring Ahmadi non-Muslim, defining Muslim through constitution, declaring Friday as weekly holiday, incorporating Islamic provisions in the constitution including Islam as

the official religion, establishment of CII etc, it can be termed as his mere political compulsions. The process might have helped the country for the time being, however, it set the stage for Zia-ul-Haq to use religion for justifying his long stay in power and converting Pakistan into a totalitarian state.

Interestingly, an explicitly secular leader was the actual harbinger of Islamization in Pakistan. Bhutto used the name of Islam for his political purposes. He used religion just to strengthen his own position. He not only initiated the process of Islamization of Pakistan but also started using religion for his own motives. He was neither sincere in Islamization of Pakistan nor wanted it to happen. But what he did was his sheer political compulsion.

References

- Ahmad, M. (2010). Islam as a Political Tool: The Bhutto Era of Islamization of Pakistan, retrieved from, <http://baytunur.blogspot.com/2010/05/islam-as-political-tool-bhutto-era-of.html> October 7, 2019
- How and why Qadianis (Ahmadis) were declared as Non-Muslims by Pakistan National Assembly? (2015). Retrieved from: <http://exahmadi.blogspot.com/2015/09/how-and-why-qadianis-ahmadis-were.html> October 7, 2019
- Ballard, R. (2012). The Ahmadiyyas Of Pakistan a Historical Overview and an Assessment of Their Current Position, Retrieved from <http://www.casas.org.uk/papers/pdfpapers/ahmadiyyasinpakistan.pdf> September 16, 2019
- Chengappa, B. M. (2002). Pakistan: Impact of Islamic socialism. Strategic Analysis, 26(1), 27-47. Retrieved from, <https://doi.org/10.1080/09700160208450024> July 20, 2019
- Conn, H. M. (1976). Islamic Socialism in Pakistan: An Overview. *Islamic Studies*, 15(2), 111-121. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/20846988> September 16, 2019
- Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan (1973).
- Hasan, M. (2000). *The Mirage of Power*. Oxford University Press.
- Hussain, M. (2016). Muslim Nationalism in South Asia: Evolution Through Constitutional Reforms”, *Journal of Political Studies*, Vol. 1, Issue 2, 65-77, accessed, February 2, 2016
- Junejo, C. A. (1996). *Zulfikar Ali Bhutto: A Memoir*. National Commission on History and Culture.
- Mody, P. (1973). *Zulfi My Friend*. Delhi: Thomson Press (India), Publication Division.
- Objectives Resolution, Retrieved from <http://www.na.gov.pk/en/content.php?id=74> May 18, 2015
- Paracha, N. F. (2013). The 1974 ouster of the ‘heretics’: What really happened?, Dawn, Nov 21, 2013,
- Riaz, H. (1985). Islamization: An Analysis of Religious, Political and Social Change in Pakistan, *Middle Eastern Studies*, Vol. 21, No. 3 (Jul., 1985), pp. 263-284, Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/4283071> July 20, 2019.
- Shah, S. M. H. (n.d). *Bhutto, Zia and Islam* (N.P), Retrieved from http://bhutto.org/Acrobat/Bhutto_Zia_and_Islam.pdf, February 2, 2016
- Taseer, S. (1979). *Bhutto: A Political Biography*. London: Ithaca Press.
- Wolpert, S. (1993). *Zulfi Bhutto of Pakistan: His Life and Times*, New York: Oxford University Press.
- Ziring, L. (1984). From Islamic Republic to Islamic State in Pakistan, *Asian Survey*, Vol. 24, No. 9, 931-946. Retrieved from <https://www.jstor.org/stable/2644077>. February 2, 2016
- Zulfikar Ali Bhutto Speeches and Statements October 1, 1972 – December 31, 1972, 106